

## **POLICE ADVISORY AND REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES**

Chairperson Rosa Mar called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on Thursday, January 30, 2020 at the Lonsdale Area Ministry Complex located in Knoxville, Tennessee.

**Attending Committee:** Rosa Mar, Frank Shanklin, Robert Gibson, Ann Barker, LaKenya Middlebrook, Leticia Flores, Jered Croom

**Not Attending:** NA

**Attending PARC Staff:** Clarence L. Vaughn, III, PARC Executive Director; Ola Blackmon-McBride, Executive Assistant

**Attending KPD/City of Knoxville Staff:** Chief Eve Thomas, Deputy Chief Kenny Miller, Deputy Chief Ronald Green, Captain David Powell, Lieutenant Steve Still, Sergeant Jonathan Chadwell, Sergeant Amanda Bunch, Investigator Michael Washam, Officer John Morgan, Attorney Lisa Hatfield, Deborah Thomas, & Charles Lomax, Community Empowerment Director

### **INTRODUCTION**

Chairperson Rosa Mar welcomed meeting participants to the 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Police Advisory and Review Committee meeting. In addition, Ms. Mar informed guests of the facilities and request to sign in on the provided documents for attendance purposes.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Chairperson Rosa Mar asked if committee members had reviewed minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter PARC meeting held on October 23, 2019 at the Small Assembly Room located in the City County Building. There were no changes or edits requested, and the 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter meeting minutes were approved.

### **SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS & EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT – Clarence Vaughn, III**

Executive Director Vaughn gave a report of the 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter speaking engagements and Executive Director's report.

### **SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS**

- October 20, 2019** The Executive Director along with a representative from the Community Relations Department for the City of Knoxville were invited to serve as guest speakers for the Jack and Jill of America, Knoxville Chapter Teen Group. The conversation was geared towards the functions of the Community Relations Department and the assigned departments it comprises of.
- November 5, 2019** The Executive Director served as the facilitator for members of the 100 Black Men of Knoxville and their mentees as they took part in a tour of the City and County Building. The tour consisted of involvement from City of Knoxville Departments, Knox County District Attorney General's Office, and the Knox County Sheriff Office.
- November 17, 2019** The Executive Director was asked to serve as a guest speaker for the "Real Talk" student group at Sarah Moore Green Elementary School. The discussion topic was based on "Knowing Your Rights and Responsibilities".
- December 5, 2019** The Executive Director along with members of the Office of Neighborhoods and Knoxville Police



Department hosted the final “Neighborhood Safety Workshop” at the Arnstein Jewish Community Center. The conversation outlined criminal activity and safety practices for citizens within the West Knoxville area, including data of criminal activity taken place throughout the City of Knoxville.

**December 6, 2019** The Executive Director was invited to serve as a guest speaker for the Knoxville Civitian Club. The presentation was based on PARC’s structure and history along with data on the methods and practices of Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement.

**December 9, 2019** The Executive Director served as a presenter for the Knoxville Police Department’s 2019-A Basic Recruit Class. The recruits took part in presentations outlining the function and structure of the Police Advisory and Review Committee along with a discussion on Cultural Competency and Bia Based Policing.

**December 13, 2019** The Executive Director was invited serve as a guest speaker to members of the Penultimate Group, which is designed as a leadership development program for young African American Males either entering or being introduce to college and the workforce. The discussion was focused on “Surviving the Interaction”.

**December 17, 2019** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the Knoxville Interdenominational Christian Ministry Alliance, in which the discussion topic was centered on the history, structure, and function of PARC. Meeting attendees were also provided with a brief historical review of Civilian Oversight nationwide.

Attendees were reminded if anyone would like PARC to speak to their organization, please call Clarence Vaughn at the PARC office, 865-215-3869. This information can also found in the Informational Brochure available at the sign-in table.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT**

The Committee audits all completed investigations from the Internal Affairs Unit of the Knoxville Police Department for completeness. The results of the first quarter audits were as follows:

**Total of Cases Audited by the Police Advisory and Review Committee were (4) Referral Action Forms and (3) Internal Affairs Case:**

**Officers Disciplined** 2  
**Civilian Employees Disciplined** 0

<u>Action Imposed</u>	<u>Number of Officers</u>	<u>Number of Civilian Employees</u>
<b>Verbal Counseling</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>

The Police Advisory and Review Committee and the Executive Director concurred with Internal Affairs’s conclusions on cases reviewed. The Executive Director and committee members asked for additional information on six of the seven cases reviewed. The additional information was provided to members of the committee to answer questions and concerns posed.

**AUDITS OF KPD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

Reviewed the following ordinances, policies, and procedures as result of the Executive Director’s evaluation of the Internal Affairs Investigations and complaints brought to the Executive Director:

- General Order 1.36 (Harassment)



- General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)
- General Order 1.60 (Response to Resistance)
- General Order 3.3 (Procedures for impoundment and Towing of Motor Vehicles)
- General Order 4.6 (Criminal Investigations)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.21 (Unsatisfactory Performance)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.24 (Use of Force)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.19 (Unbecoming Conduct)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.04 (Conduct – General)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.07 (Truthfulness)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.00 (Courtesy)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.01 (Responding to Calls)

### **ADVOCACY (STRENGTHENING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIZENS AND THE KPD)**

- The Executive Director continues to meet with members of the Knoxville Police Department’s Command Staff and Internal Affairs Unit on a regular basis to discuss concerns and best practices that will result in effective ways to improve relationships with community members.
- The Executive Director along with members of the Office of Neighborhoods and the Knoxville Police Department host a series of workshops directed towards neighborhood safety. The workshop includes information presented from the “Community Crime Map – Lexis Nexis”, which provides data on criminal activities that have taken place in different sections of Knoxville. Information is shared with meeting participants about safety tips and best practices to keep neighborhoods safe.
- The Executive Director was asked to take part in the 2019-A Basic Recruit Training Academy, in which the training topic was centered on Cultural Competency and Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement. Attendees took part in a discussion to evaluate cultural and social bias along with receiving best practices to overcome unconscious biases.

### **COMMUNITY OUTREACH**

- The Executive Director continues to meet with citizens, community groups, and neighborhood associations to discuss concerns and complaints to develop plans for helpful resolutions. The resolutions are based on the areas of concern presented by community members and the information is shared with the appropriate agency or department involved.
- The Executive Director along with members of the Community Relations Department served as table hosts for the annual Vine Middle School college and career fair. Students were able to learn about the function and services offered by the Community Relations Department. In addition, participants were encouraged to become more aware of resources and services provided by various City of Knoxville departments.

### **NETWORKING**

- The Executive Director was elected to the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement Board of Directors as a Member-at-Large. The National Board of Directors serve as the governing body for

the organization which represents civilian oversight agencies and practitioners nationwide.

- The Executive Director continues to serve as a part of the Knoxville Chamber of Commerce Diversity Champion group. Members meet to share and provide awareness to issues and concerns that impact disadvantage and marginalized communities within the City of Knoxville and surrounding areas.

Chairperson Rosa Mar reminded everyone that if they wished to speak at the meeting tonight during “Open Forum” to please sign up on the green sheet located at the sign-in table.

## **PARC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **Audio/Video Subcommittee – Leticia Flores**

Of the (4) Referral Action Forms and (3) Internal Affairs Case reviewed by the PARC, there were **six** cases which documented audio and video recordings.

Audio/Video Subcommittee submits the following findings for our **4<sup>th</sup>Quarter** review:

#### **File #1 Referral Action Form**

The incident took place inside a residence, in which the person of interest was asked to leave the place of residence due to the homeowner’s request. The interaction between the complainant and officers involved was properly recorded and accessible via audio recordings.

#### **File #2 Referral Action Form**

Initially, the officer involved failed to properly activate his wireless microphone. Once realized, the officer retrieved his wireless microphone and properly activated his recording devices which captured the interaction between the officer and complainant. The infraction was documented as being not based upon the original complaint, in which the officer received verbal counseling from his immediate supervisor.

#### **File #3 IAU Case #18-2801**

All officers involved in the incident properly activated their wireless microphone excluding an officer who failed to properly activate his wireless microphone (body microphone). The officer failed to charge his wireless microphone using the charging station in his patrol vehicle. The infraction was documented and the officer was received counseling.

#### **File #5 IAU Case # 19-2813**

The officer’s wireless microphone was correctly activated, in which the alleged incident was recorded in its entirety. The complainant was heard explaining their concerns, and the officer involved was observed responding to the complainant.

#### **File #6 IAU Case #19-2802**

The officers involved properly activated their audio and video equipment devices. An officer who was involved in the incident served as a training officer, in which their interaction was recorded by the senior officer’s wireless microphone.

#### **File #7 Referral Action Form**

The officer involved appropriately activated their wireless microphones for purposes of audio recording, and the officer placed their patrol vehicle in a direction to capture video

recording of the alleged incident. The officer was seen speaking to the complainant and another involved party, in which the complete conversation was recorded and accessible for further review.

## **SUMMARY**

The Knoxville Police Department's General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment) details that Officers shall turn on their audio and video equipment when they are out of their patrol unit on a call-for-service in the event audio is needed to substantiate or assist with documentation of their law enforcement duties, i.e., domestic disturbance, etc. It should be remembered that the purpose of the in-car video equipment is to monitor all contacts with a person in the community in all situations possible. Please note that the Knoxville Police Department requires Sergeants to review officers' audio and visual footage twice per month to ensure that their wireless microphones are operating properly.

## **RACIAL PROFILING SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT – Jered Croom**

There was one alleged profiling case reviewed by PARC during the 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter.

### **Case #1 Summary:**

The Police Advisory and Review Committee received a citizen complaint form in regards to an alleged series of incidents that took place between the months of March thru October of 2019. The complainant shared concerns of being discriminated against due to being a “gay men”. The complaint derived from a previous allegation made against a Knoxville Police Department officer in regards to the officer associating with an individual who was said to be under investigation by the Knoxville Police Department for harassment claims made by the complainant. The complainant's initial complaint made to PARC was reviewed and the findings were shared with the complainant. However, the complainant alleged that issues continued to occur and escalate between himself and the suspect. The complainant shared that he brought forth concerns to the Knoxville Police Department in which the complainant felt as though he was, “being overlooked and not provided with assistance”. Therefore, the complainant submitted an additional complaint classified as “discrimination” based on the complainant's allegations of being overlooked and dismissed due to his sexual orientation.

### **Conclusion:**

In regards to the matter involving discrimination, there was no sufficient evidence presented to support the allegation. The basis of the citizen's complaint has been assigned to the Knoxville Police Department's Violent Crimes Unit, in which a request has been made to schedule a mediation session to ensure that the complainant's concerns are addressed and reviewed by members of the Knoxville Police Department.

## **General Order 1.41 Bias Based Policing**

### **I. Policy**

It is the policy of the Knoxville Police Department that we are committed to preserving the peace and maintaining order in the City of Knoxville by practicing bias-free policing and respecting the rights and dignity of all citizens.

### **II. Definition**

Bias Based Profiling - The practice of stopping, detaining or searching a person based solely upon a common trait or a group that includes but is not limited to their race, color ethnicity, age, gender sexual orientation, religion, economic status or any other identifiable group characteristic.

**OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

**Quarter-to-Date Operations Report**

Ms. Ann Barker reported on the quarterly totals of the 2019 cases, received, and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period **October 1, 2019 – December 31, 2019.**

Total Cases for the Quarter	22
Cases Closed in the Quarter	16
<b>Resolution of Cases Closed for the Quarter</b>	
Executive Director	10
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	0
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	4
KPD	2
Total Cases Resolved	16
<b>Total Cases Pending for the Quarter</b>	<b>6</b>
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases <b><u>Referred</u></b> to IAU for the Quarter	1
IAU Completed Cases <b><u>Reviewed</u></b> by PARC for the Quarter	3
IAU Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	4
IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases	0



## Year-to-Date Operations Report

Mr. Robert Gibson reported on the annual totals of the 2019 cases, received, and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period **January 1, 2019 – December 31, 2019**.

	<b>01/01/19 - 12/31/19</b>
1. TOTAL CASES BROUGHT TO PARC 9/22/98 TO PRESENT: <u>2579</u>	85
2. TOTAL CASES CLOSED 9/22/98 TO PRESENT: <u>2555</u>	79
A) Resolved by Executive Director	53
B) Resolved by Mediation Executive Director & KPD	2
C) Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	11
D) Resolved by KPD	13
E) Resolved by Executive Assistant	0
F) Resolved by Executive Assistant & KPD	0
3. TOTAL CASES PENDING	6
4. PARC Cases Referred to IAU for the year	3
5. IAU Cases Reviewed by PARC Executive Director & Committee	23
A) IAU Cases	12
B) IAU Referral Action Forms	11
6. IAU case conclusions concurred with the Executive Director & Committee without further review or questions	22
7. IAU case conclusions not concurred with the Executive Director or Committee members	1
8. IAU cases reviewed by the Executive Director & Committee with additional information requested	16

## PARC ORIGIN OF CASE COMPLAINANTS

*Ethnic/Gender Origin of Case Complaints Received*

Ethnic Background/ Origin	1/01/2018-12/31/2018		1/01/2019 – 12/31/2019	
	Total #	%	Total #	%
White Male	20	23%	19	22%
White Female	23	26%	23	27%
<b>Total</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>49%</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>49%</b>
African American Male	15	17%	18	21%
African American Female	19	22%	14	16%
<b>Total</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>39%</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>38%</b>
Hispanic Male	0	0%	3	4%
Hispanic Female	2	2%	0	0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2%</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4%</b>
Asian Male	0	0%	0	0%
Asian Female	0	0%	1	1%
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1%</b>
Native American Male	0	0%	0	0%
Native American Female	0	0%	0	0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0%</b>
Unknown Male	0	0%	0	0%
Unknown Female	5	6%	0	0%
Unknown	3	3%	2	2%
<b>Total</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>9%</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2%</b>
Other Male	0	0%	2	2%
Other Female	0	0%	3	4%
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0%</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6%</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>100%</b>

## PARC NATURE OF CASES (YEAR-TO-DATE)

01/01/19– 12/31/2019

*(Note: Some complaints involve more than one type of allegation; therefore, the total may exceed the total number of complaints received)*

### Nature of Cases

Assault (Alleged or Attempted)	1
Citizen's Advocate (PARC addressing public safety and citizen concern)	6
Conduct Toward The Public	1
Conflict of Interest	1
Discrimination	1
Discrimination: Age	1
Dissemination of Information	1
Employee Misconduct	1
Excessive Force	1
Failure to Arrest Person(s) Responsible for Crime	2
Failure to Make An Arrest	1
Failure to Perform Duty (In a Timely Manner)	1
Failure to Perform/Provide Duty or Services	5
Failure to Provide a Citation	1
Failure to Report Investigative Outcome to Complainant	3
Failure to Respond to Call/Inappropriate Police Response to Call	1
Failure to Return Personal Items/ Money, Items Taken By Officer	3
Failure to Submit Department Report	2
Failure/Refusal to Make/Complete A Report	1
False Accusation/Reputation Damaged by Investigation	1
Harassment	6
Illegal Search & Seizure	2
Illegal Towing of Vehicle	1
Improper/Inappropriate Police Action	2
Improper/Inappropriate Police Action -Not Operating Vehicle in a Safe Manner	1
Improper/Inappropriate Police Action -Running Red Light/Stop Sign	1

<b>Inaccurate Accident/Incident Report or Biased</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Inaccurate Information on Citation</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Inappropriate/Unprofessional Conduct (Laughing, Profanity, Over-Reaction,</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Intimidation of a Minor</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Intimidation/Antagonize</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>KPD Lack of Enforcement : Loitering</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Performance of Duty</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Police Misconduct</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Profiling: Other</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Rudeness – Courtesy Violation – Disrespectful Attitude</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Racial Profiling</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Unbecoming/Unprofessional Conduct</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Unfair Treatment</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Unlawful/Illegal Citation</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Unnecessary Arrest</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Unsatisfactory Performance</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Use of Force/Assault</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Violation of Civil Rights</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Wrongfully Arrested</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>92</b>

**PARC TRAINING SESSION: 2019 PARC AND KPD ANNUAL REPORT**

PARC Executive Director, Clarence Vaughn, presented the 2019 Annual Report. Deputy Chief Ron Green presented an overview of the types of crimes that occurred in the city in 2019.

**CASE MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED BY THE COMMITTEE**

PARC received seven cases during the 4 quarter. No questions were addressed.

**CITIZENS ASKED TO APPEAR BEFORE PARC**

Ms. Yvonne Stephens and Ms. Deborah Langston requested to appear before PARC but was not in attendance.

**OPEN FORUM**

Rick Roach – Mr. Roach asked questions surrounding the use of drones.

**COMMUNITY UPDATES**

Debbie Sharp, Office of Neighborhood and Empowerment, announced that the Neighborhood Conference would be March 28, 2020 from 8 a.m.-2 p.m., at the Knoxville Convention Center.

The meeting adjourned

Respectfully Submitted,  
Clarence L. Vaughn III, Executive Director